

DEFINITE SOLUTION OF THE TWO CAPACITORS PARADOX

Vladan Panković, Miodrag Krmar

Department of Physics, Faculty of Sciences, 21000 Novi Sad,
Trg Dositeja Obradovića 4., Serbia, vpankovic@if.ns.ac.yu

PACS number: 41.20-q

Abstract

In this work we suggest very simple solution of the two capacitors paradox in the completely ideal (without any electrical resistance or inductivity) electrical circuit. Namely, it is shown that electrical field energy loss corresponds to works done by electrical fields of both capacitors by movement of the electrical charge. It is all and nothing more (some dissipative processes, e.g. Joule heating and electromagnetic wave emission effects) is necessary.

As it is well-known in many remarkable textbooks and articles referring on the basic electrical and electro-dynamical principles and their applications [1]-[7] two capacitors problem or paradox is formulated and considered. Given paradox, simply speaking, states the following. By charging of the second, initially non-charged, by the first, initially charged, capacitor in an ideal (without any electrical resistance and inductivity) electrical circuit there is loss of one half of the initial energy of the electrical field.

It is well-known too that there are many different attempts of the solution of mentioned paradox [4]-[7]. Generally speaking these solutions suppose that electrical circuit cannot be ideal, even not approximately, or, that some small (residual) electrical resistances or/and inductivities must exist. Then given electrical field energy loss can be explained by dissipative, thermal processes (Joule heating) or electro-magnetic waves emission. However, all this needs very complex theoretical formalism in distinction to theoretically extremely simple formulation of the paradox itself.

In this work we shall suggest very simple solution of the two capacitors paradox in the completely ideal (without any electrical resistance or inductivity) electrical circuit. (More precisely we shall consider that really existing resistance and inductivities yield only high order corrections which here can be neglected.) Namely, it will be shown that electrical field energy loss corresponds to works done by electrical fields of both capacitors by movement of the electrical charge. It is all and nothing more (some dissipative processes, e.g. Joule heating and electromagnetic wave emission effects) is necessary.

As it is well-known [1]-[7] two capacitors paradox can be formulated in the following way. Consider a simple electrical circuit that holds only one switch and two identical capacitors with the same capacitance C , without any resistance and inductivity.

Initially, switch is in the state OFF so that electrical circuit is open. Then first capacitor is charged by electrical charge Q and holds voltage $V = \frac{Q}{C}$, while second capacitor is without charge and voltage. Energy of the electric field within the first capacitor equals, as it is well-known,

$$E_{1in} = \frac{1}{2}CV^2 = \frac{Q^2}{2C} \quad (1)$$

while electrical field (energy) within second capacitor does not exist at all. For this reason total energy of the electrical fields within both capacitors equals E_{1in} (1) too.

But when switch turns out in the state ON electrical circuit becomes closed and during a very small time interval both capacitors become oppositely charged with electrical charges $\frac{Q}{2}$ and $-\frac{Q}{2}$ and hold opposite voltages $\frac{V}{2}$ and $-\frac{V}{2}$. In other words, during this small time interval charge $\frac{Q}{2}$ turns out from the first on the second capacitor. Then, energies of the electric field within the first and second capacitor are identical. Given energies equal, as it is well-known,

$$E_{1fin} = E_{2fin} = \frac{1}{2}C\left(\frac{V}{2}\right)^2 = \frac{1}{2}\frac{Q^2}{4C} \quad (2)$$

so that total energy of the electrical fields within both capacitors equals

$$E_{fin} = E_{1fin} + E_{2fin} = 2\frac{1}{2}C\left(\frac{V}{2}\right)^2 = \frac{1}{4}CV^2 = \frac{Q^2}{4C} = \frac{1}{2}E_{1in}. \quad (3)$$

In this way there is the following, seemingly paradoxical, energy loss

$$\Delta E = E_{fin} - E_{1in} = -\frac{1}{4}CV^2 = -\frac{1}{2}E_{1in} \quad (4)$$

or energy difference between the initial and final state of given electrical circuit.

Consider now total energy of the electrical fields of both capacitors more accurately.

Suppose that first capacitor holds some charge q and voltage $v = \frac{q}{C}$, while second capacitor holds charge $Q - q$ and voltage $V - v$, for $\frac{Q}{2} \leq q \leq Q$. Then total energy of the electrical field of both capacitors equals

$$E = E_1 + E_2 = \frac{q^2}{2C} + \frac{(Q - q)^2}{2C}. \quad (5)$$

Suppose, now, that by action of the electrical fields, charge of the first capacitor decreases and charge of the second capacitor increases for an infinite small value dq . Then total energy of the electrical fields of both capacitors becomes

$$E + dE = \frac{(q - dq)^2}{2C} + \frac{(Q - q + dq)^2}{2C} = E - \frac{q}{C}dq + \frac{Q - q}{C}dq \quad (6)$$

where small terms proportional to $(dq)^2$, are neglected.

It implies

$$dE = -\frac{q}{C}dq + \frac{Q - q}{C}dq = -vdq + (V - v)dq. \quad (7)$$

As it is well-known $-vdq$ can be considered as the work of the electrical field of first capacitor by movement of the charge dq from one at the other plate of the condenser. Also, as it is well-known,

$(V - v)dq$ can be considered as the work of the electrical field of second capacitor by movement of the charge dq from one at the other plate of the capacitor. In this way (7) can be considered as the law of the conservation of the energy of the electrical fields. In other words diminishing of the energy of electrical fields is equivalent to works done by both electrical fields by movement of the electrical charge from one at the other plate of any of capacitors.

Simple integration of (7) over $[\frac{Q}{2}, Q]$ interval of the values of q , yields

$$\Delta E = -\frac{Q^2}{4C}. \quad (8)$$

It is, obviously, identical to (4).

In this way we obtain very simple and reasonable solution of the two capacitors paradox in the completely ideal (without any electrical resistance or inductivity) electrical circuit. (More precisely we shall consider that really existing resistance and inductivities yield only high order corrections which here can be neglected.)

In conclusion, the following can be shortly repeated and pointed out. In this work we suggest very simple solution of the two capacitors paradox in the completely ideal (without any electrical resistance or inductivity) electrical circuit. Namely, it is shown that electrical field energy loss corresponds to works done by electrical fields of both capacitors by movement of the electrical charge. It is all and nothing more (some dissipative processes, e.g. Joule heating and electromagnetic wave emission effects) is necessary.

Author is deeply grateful to Prof. Dr. Darko Kapor for illuminating discussions.

References

- [1] D. Halliday, R. Resnick, *Physics, Vol. II* (J. Willey, New York, 1978)
- [2] F. W. Sears, M.W. Zemansky, *University Physics* (Addison-Wesley, Reading, MA, 1964)
- [3] M. A. Plonus, *Applied Electromagnetics*, (McGraw-Hill, New York, 1978)
- [4] E. M. Purcell, *Electricity and Magnetism, Berkeley Physics Course Vol. II* (McGraw-Hill, New York, 1965)
- [5] R. A. Powel, *Two-capacitor problem: A more realistic view*, Am. J. Phys. **47** (1979) 460
- [6] T. B. Boykin, D. Hite, N. Singh, Am. J. Phys. **70** (2002) 460
- [7] K. T. McDonald, *A Capacitor Paradox*, class-ph/0312031